Mimes (seventh or eighth century). In this text, a group of prostitutes sent to deter martyrs embrace the Christian faith themselves. In so doing, they find “control over their own bodies and souls,” culminating in a choice for “ultimate freedom over their bodies by choosing martyrdom” (p. 111). This contribution is to be commended for its multifaceted exploration of body, gender, sexuality, and social status in a Syriac text.

A useful exploration of the pneumatology of the East Syriac Isaac of Nineveh, written by Nestor Kavvadas (Tübingen), immediately follows Horn’s piece, followed by Jonathan Loopstra’s investigation of certain West Syriac collections of patristic “difficult words” preserved in Vat. Syr. 152. Almost three centuries ago, J. S. Assemani attributed these collections to Jacob of Edessa (d. 708). Loopstra entertains an alternative possibility: later scribes may have compiled these collections, which then became erroneously associated with Jacob of Edessa from a tradition that he had corrected certain patristic texts (e.g., the *Orations* of Gregory Nazianzen).

The next two essays are historical in tone. The first, “Die ersten Christen in Syrien,” anchors the low end of the monograph’s stated chronological interest. In it, Anna Maria Schwemer (Tübingen) attempts to provide a brief history of the origins of Christianity in the cities of Antioch and Edessa. Her task is obviously complicated by the fragmentary or dubious nature of the biblical evidence and the scarcity of patristic evidence. Still, she produces a critical discussion I believe provides an excellent starting point for future discussions.

Immediately following Schwemer’s contribution is the exploration by Hans Reinhard Seeliger (Tübingen) of the post-Nicene episcopal sees of Syro-Palestine. This essay provides a valuable resource for early Byzantine historians, cataloguing Christian centers in the region from the material and literary data. Attention is also given to the functions of cathedral churches in the region.

In the penultimate essay, Felix Thome (Tübingen) offers a glimpse into the exegetical genius of the Church of the East, exploring the theme of “God’s love for lost humanity” in the Genesis homilies of Narsai of Edessa. Finally, Jürgen Tubach (Halle/Saale) concludes the volume with an analysis of the “The Hymn of the Pearl” from the Acts of Thomas, the oldest extant Syriac poem.

As a single collection, the book is strongest when it pairs essays of like character (e.g., Bumazhnov and Engleman). It is unfortunate, then, that the grouping principles were not explored in the design of the collection. At the very least, it would have been useful to distinguish the collection’s literary studies (e.g., Horn and Thome) from its historical (e.g., Abramowski and Schwemer) and archeological studies (i.e., Gaube and Seeliger). The layout of the volume is fairly clean, though small errors are apparent (e.g., an unnecessary blank space appears on p. 74, and the first paragraph on p. 158 should be indented). It is also worth noting that the collection does contain several editorial errors. One outstanding example appears on p. 186, no. 57, where the right to left text of the first Hebrew formula has been reversed, evidently through a software error. Additionally, several typographical errors have also made it to print in the manuscript (as a single example, consider the juxtaposition of “Burxeles” and “Bruxelles” in consecutive lines of p. 59, no. 9). Strangely, Tubach’s article does not provide bibliographic information within footnotes, as do the other articles, but includes a final bibliography instead. A consistent system of citation across all essays would have been appreciated.

Hugo Méndez
Yale University

The Ashgate Research Companion to Islamic Law. Edited by Rudolph Peters and Peri Bearman. Farnham, Surrey, UK: Ashgate, 2014. Pp. x + 345. $149.95, £95.

The scope and vision of Wael Hallaq’s comprehensive history of Islamic law, *Sharīʿa: Theory, Practice, Transformations* (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 2009), has made it difficult to imagine the appearance of similarly broad narrative treatments of the topic anytime soon. That is in a way unfortunate because, for all the value of Hallaq’s book, it presents the subject of Islamic law, no matter the

المنارة للاستشارات
www.m

period, through the prism of a Foucauldian-Saidian critique of colonialism, an approach that is simultaneously understandable and more than occasionally distracting. In the near and medium term, maybe what we should expect, then, are handbooks and surveys of the state of the field. The excellent volume under review offers just such a survey of the state of the academic study of Islamic law. The editors are to be congratulated—in a period characterized in this reviewer's opinion by too many handbooks and overviews—for fashioning a volume that provides overviews of a large number of discrete topics in ways that are efficient, accurate, intellectually satisfying, informative, and approachable.

The *Ashgate Research Companion* (*ARC*) has twenty-two chapters, including an introduction to the volume by the editors and an epilogue by Abdullahi Ahmed An-Na'im. In their preface the editors explain that they aim to "present classical Islamic law through a historiographical introduction to and analysis of the Western scholarship and key debates that have formed the field and continue to provoke new ways of thinking about long-standing issues in this increasingly relevant and popular discipline" (p. ix). Except for the introductory first chapter, the articles that make up the volume are distributed across four sections—covering historical, substantive, modern, and contemporary aspects respectively.

In chapter one ("Introduction: The Nature of the Sharia"), the editors describe the volume's focus as being on the Sharia's "legal normativity" rather than a more expansive "normativity in the fields of ritual, morality, and law" (p. 1). For purposes of this volume, a legal rule is one for which "compliance can be enforced by the judiciary or [. . .] executive" (p. 2), and Sharia is "the sum of enforceable legal norms dealing with obligations and rights between humans" (p. 5). This excludes ritual law from the volume even though "The Sharia can be labeled as a religious law" (p. 2) and the editors recognize that the moral dimension (but perhaps not the ritual dimension) may be central to its ontology (pp. 3–4). The causes of doctrinal diversity are described and the existence of primary and secondary rules (as formulated by H. L. A. Hart) is noted, except that secondary rules governing change in the law are said to be "[t]heoretically lacking" (pp. 6–7). Finally, the theoretical tension between the Sharia's divine origins and the modern impulse to ground law in the authority of the state is recognized (pp. 7–9).

Space precludes any but the most cursory (and thus inadequate) description of the remaining chapters, which is no reflection on their quality.

The first section, "The Historical Islamic Law," opens with chapter two ("The Origins of the Sharia") by Knut S. Vikør, who outlines the history of Western scholarship on "origins" and summarizes modern Muslim responses to figures such as Joseph Schacht as well as the more recent conclusions of Harald Motzki, Wael Hallaq, and others. In chapter three ("The Divine Sources") Herbert Berg describes modern scholarly debates over the early history of the Quran and the authenticity of Prophetic hadith, and concludes with mention of the recent work of Angelika Neuwirth and Harald Motzki. In chapter four ("The Schools of Law") Paul R. Powers summarizes Western studies of and debates about the rise of the schools of Islamic legal thought, focusing especially on the work of Schacht, Christopher Melchert, and Hallaq, and then characterizes the social and institutional function of the schools. Robert Gleave discusses Islamic legal theory in chapter five ("Deriving Rules of Law") by characterizing modern scholarship on the rise of hermeneutics, issues of genre, and the question of the purpose of Islamic legal theory. The judiciary and the institution of the mufti—courts and independent, fatwa-issuing jurists—are treated by Brinkley Messick in chapter six ("The Judge and the Mufti") with special attention to the dialogue between modern historians and anthropologists in their descriptions of Islamic legal institutions. Mohammad Fadel explores, in chapter seven ("State and Sharia"), the "contentious" relationship between Islamic law and the state, providing a brief history of modern scholarship, a survey of Shiite and Kharijite doctrine, and suggestions for future research. In the final chapter eight of this section ("Qanun and Sharia"), Boğaç A. Ergene describes the relationship between Islamic law and Ottoman legislation and notes the ways in which the existence of a body of Ottoman public law can nuance our understanding of Sharia.

In chapter nine ("Equality before the Law"), which opens the section on "Substantive Islamic Law," Gianluca P. Parolin summarizes the Sharia's notions of status and capacity as they applied differentially to various subjects of the law. Christina Jones-Pauly, in chapter ten ("Gender Relations"), focuses on status and capacity as they relate to gender and in particular to issues of family law. Chapter eleven ("Socio-Economic Justice"), by Hiroyuki Yanagihashi, describes both ethical and doctrinal aspects of

المنارة للاستشارات
www.m

Islamic commercial law by focusing on notions of property and contract. In chapter twelve ("Public Order"), Christian R. Lange deals with Islamic penal law (including the torts of injury to the person and homicide) and also with the exercise of force and coercion by the state. Andrew F. March, in chapter thirteen ("Constitutional Authority"), summarizes Sunni doctrine on the caliphate, the jurists' realism in the post-caliphal period, and Ottoman notions of constitutional legitimacy. In the section's final chapter fourteen ("War and Peace"), Sohail H. Hashmi gives a lucid overview of the Islamic law of war and Islamic humanitarian law.

The third section, "Islamic Law through the Prism of the Modern State," begins with Léon Buskens's chapter fifteen ("Sharia and the Colonial State"), offering a clear and comprehensive account of the tortured relationship between the colonizers' objectives and tactics and indigenous Islamic legal institutions. In chapter sixteen ("Sharia and the Nation State") Maurits S. Berger develops a three-stage model for the process by which Sharia has become appropriated by or integrated into the modern state. Martin Lau, in chapter seventeen ("The Re-Islamization of Legal Systems"), examines legal systems (some only provincial within a larger state framework) in Pakistan, northern Nigeria, Malaysia, Indonesia, and India that have taken steps to reapply Islamic law.

ARC's final section, "Present-Day Discussions about Sharia," opens with Abdullah Saeed's presentation, in chapter eighteen ("Sharia and Finance"), of the history of modern Islamic finance through a survey of institutions, specific transactions, and religiously inspired critiques. Mathias Rohe describes the varied modalities of and debates about Sharia in the lives of Muslim migrants to the West in chapter nineteen ("Sharia and the Muslim Diaspora"). In chapter twenty ("Sharia and Modernity") Kristine Kalanges reviews debates over Sharia's relationship to democracy, constitutionalism, and human rights. Birgit Krawietz tackles some of the concrete aspects of Sharia and modern science in an exploration of the responses of Muslim scholars and observant Muslim laypersons to dilemmas of modern medical ethics in chapter twenty-one ("Sharia and Medical Ethics").

The final chapter, styled "Epilogue: The Normative Relevance of Sharia in the Modern Context," by Abdullahi Ahmed An-Naʿim, argues, as An-Naʿim has done elsewhere, that Islamic law was only ever meant as a guide to personal piety and that attempts to link it to the modern state should be viewed as ahistorical and thus with suspicion.

Although I found every single essay useful, insightful, and sophisticated, there are two things about the volume that call for comment. One, which readers of this review may have noticed, is the prevalence of treatments of topics related to what might be called "Islamic government." By my count, there are at least seven articles out of the twenty-two that deal with this material in one way or another: "State and Sharia," "Qanun and Sharia," "Public Order," "Constitutional Authority," "Sharia and the Colonial State," "Sharia and the Nation State," and "The Re-Islamization of Legal Systems." To this list one could add An-Naʿim's epilogue, which restates his own idiosyncratic view that Islamic law was never really connected with government. All these topics are of interest, of course, but their predominance gives a public law valence to the whole volume. Maybe this weighting of the material reflects current obsessions with Islamic government and Islamically inspired political resistance. Maybe it is a sign that the field is moving away from viewing Islamic law as a mostly theoretical, scholastically elaborated jurisprudence and toward viewing it as a fully integrated legal system no matter the place or period. Maybe it is a combination of both trends.

The other feature of the volume that might strike readers is the absence of chapters devoted solely to legal doctrine in its various conventional subject matter areas, notwithstanding the six chapters that make up the section on "Substantive Islamic Law." Perhaps it is the titles of the six chapters on substantive law that are unexpected ("Equality before the Law," "Gender Relations," "Socio-Economic Justice," "Public Order," "Constitutional Authority," and "War and Peace") and, as just noted, the fact that half of them deal with public as opposed to private law. Someone coming from another academic field and interested in substantive Islamic law might have welcomed a more conventional range of legal subject matter, such as criminal law, torts, commercial law, family law, and international relations and war, for example. The editors' decision to omit ritual perhaps also contributes to this reviewer's feeling that the section on substantive law is slightly unrepresentative. Having said that, *ARC* does offer significant discussions of doctrine, but in places that are occasionally unexpected. Commercial law, for

المنارة للاستشارات
www.m

example, is discussed separately and in very different ways in two different chapters, Yanagihashi's "Socio-Economic Justice" and Saeed's "Sharia and Finance," the latter in the section called "Present-Day Discussions about Sharia." Possibly in the editors' judgment the field no longer views the range of topics covered in typical works of *fiqh*-writing as representative of the core of Islamic law, a position that is implicit in the introductory chapter and in the selection of materials. A chapter devoted to genres of Islamic legal writing might have helped to orient non-specialists in this changing landscape.

It would be impossible to produce a survey of this (or any) field without exposing oneself to some criticisms. In the case of this book, the quality of the contributions is unusually high, and their breadth, depth, and temporal span are admirable. All in all, this work is an excellent and timely resource for students and scholars alike.

Joseph E. Lowry
University of Pennsylvania

Mālik and Medina: Islamic Legal Reasoning in the Formative Period. By Umar F. Abd-Allah Wymann-Landgraf. Islamic History and Civilization, vol. 101. Leiden: Brill, 2013. Pp. xiv + 552. $277, €199.

Mālik and Medina is an ambitious and engaging work of scholarship. It argues (1) that Mālik's concept of Medinese praxis (*ʿamal*) is a multifaceted legal tool that its critics long have failed to appreciate and (2) that most Western scholars have misunderstood the formative period of Islamic law. It is both a successful revision of the author's 1978 doctoral dissertation, "Mālik's Concept of *ʿAmal* in the Light of Mālikī Legal Theory," and a bold call for Western scholars to direct their gaze away from the presence of prophetic hadiths in early Islamic law to the far more significant role of *raʾy* ("considered opinion") in it. In short, *Mālik and Medina* is required reading for all (advanced) students and scholars of early Islamic law.

The book consists of an introduction, ten chapters arranged into two parts, and a short conclusion. While the content of the book is rich and meticulously documented, the chapter arrangement is not optimal for the reader who is relatively new to early Mālikī law. Chapter one provides a sketch of Mālik's life and clarifies the differences between his "masterpiece," the *Muwaṭṭaʾ*, and the *Mudawwana* of Saḥnūn. Chapter two offers a helpful overview of Mālik's legal reasoning, which highlights his skillful usage of analogy, discretion (*istiḥsān*), preclusion (*sadd al-dharāʾiʿ*), and the unstated good (*al-maṣāliḥ al-mursala*). Wymann-Landgraf also stresses Mālik's awareness and respect for dissent among the Medinese jurists, which is reflected in his usage of "concurrence" (*ijtimāʿ*) instead of the more common term "consensus" (*ijmāʿ*). There is also an illuminating comparison between the legal reasoning of Mālik and Abū Ḥanīfa, in which Mālik comes across as more daring in his use of discretion than the Kūfan master of the proponents of considered opinion.

Chapters three and four discuss the reception of Medinese praxis by critics and advocates, including the well-known criticisms of al-Shaybānī and al-Shāfiʿī, as well as the nuanced support of it in the correspondence between al-Layth b. Saʿd and Mālik. A particularly useful passage in chapter four is al-Qāḍī ʿIyāḍ's analysis of how the Mālikīs of each region accorded Medinese praxis differing degrees of authority (p. 234). These chapters might have been more beneficial had they been placed after the lengthy analysis of Medinese praxis (part two, pp. 273–506), because at this earlier point in the book the reader does not yet really know what it is and why it generated so much controversy.

Part two of *Mālik and Medina* begins with chapter five, which outlines Mālik's "archaic" terminology and prepares the reader for Wymann-Landgraf's valuable dissection of Medinese praxis. He divides Mālik's terms into three categories, each of which receives a chapter filled with supporting evidence in the form of discrete legal topics. These categories are "Sunna terms," "Precept terms," and "Terms referring to the People of knowledge." Sunna terms are "types of praxis deemed to have originated with the Prophet" (p. 280); precept (*amr*) terms generally consist of post-prophetic opinions that have found

المنارة للاستشارات
www.m

Reproduced with permission of copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.

للاستشارات المنارة

www.m